Question 3

Analyze the aims, methods, and degree of success of the Catholic Reformation (Counter-Reformation) in the sixteenth century.

9–6: Stronger
- Has a clear, well-developed thesis.
- Is well organized.
- Addresses the terms of the question.
- Supports the thesis with specific evidence.
- May contain minor errors; even a 9 need not be flawless.

Indicators for 9–8
- Fully engages with the terms of the question, explicitly linking aims, methods, and degree of success of the Catholic Reformation (Counter-Reformation).
- Analysis recognizes complexity of issues and events (e.g., doctrinal, political, military).
- Discussion is drawn from the sixteenth century and the context of the Catholic Reformation (Counter-Reformation).

Indicators for 7–6
- Fully engages with the terms of the question.
- Links aims, methods, and degree of success with minimal conflation of terms.
- Analyzes issues and events (e.g., doctrinal, political, military).
- Discussion is drawn from the sixteenth century and the context of the Catholic Reformation (Counter-Reformation).

5–4: Mixed
- Contains a thesis, perhaps superficial or simplistic.
- Uneven response to the question's terms.
- May contain errors, factual or interpretive.

Indicators for 5–4
- Addresses all parts of the question, perhaps in general terms.
- May conflate aims and methods or fail to distinguish adequately between the two.
- Discussion may be more descriptive than analytical.
- May contain factual errors (chronology, events, etc.) that affect interpretation.

3–0: Weaker
- Thesis is confused, absent, or merely restates the question.
- Misconstrues the question or omits major tasks.
- May contain major errors.

Indicators for 3–2
- Responds to the question with a description of the causes of the Protestant Reformation or the status of the Catholic Church.
- Essay describes events with only superficial analysis.
- May not address all parts of the question.
- May contain serious errors of fact or interpretation.

Indicators for 1–0
- May attempt to address the question but fails to do so.
- May not contain specific evidence.
- May contain significant errors of fact or interpretation.

AP® EUROPEAN HISTORY
2006 SCORING GUIDELINES
Question 3 Historical Background

The terms Catholic Reformation and Counter-Reformation are used interchangeably by most students in responding to this essay. Counter-Reformation refers to the Catholic Church's response to the Protestant movement of the sixteenth century. Some are also familiar with the Catholic Reformation in the context of the conciliar movement beginning in the early fifteenth century; however, this distinction is not necessary for this question, and students may use either term in their responses.

The question topic is well covered in commonly used textbooks, and, when paired with the Protestant Reformation, often comprises a major unit in the AP European History course in terms of amount of time spent and depth of content. The question asks students to analyze three related elements: the aims, methods, and degree of success of the Catholic Reformation (Counter-Reformation) in the sixteenth century. This creates a useful organizing schema and suggests topics for the primary task, analysis. Student responses generally engage with the question's required elements and include a variety of evidence drawn from Catholic belief and practice, political rivalry, and international relations. The most frequently cited evidence was various accounts of the Catholic response to Luther, the Council of Trent, and the founding of new orders, especially the Jesuits.

Evidence used by students follows, divided into the categories provided by the question: aims, methods, and degree of success. Items are placed in the categories where they are most often used by students. Depending on the context established in the essay, much of this material can properly appear as either aims or methods.

AIMS:

Note: *Aims* may be expressed as those of the papacy, the Curia, conciliar movement, monarchs, and/or the faithful.

- Define and clarify Church doctrine and practices.
- Respond to or contain the Protestant challenge.
- Eliminate Protestantism.
- Reform Church practices including: indulgences, simony, absentee Church office holders, monastic corruption, pluralism, incompetent or immoral clergy.
- Exert political authority over monarchs, princes.
- Monarchs used religion as an expression of their rule.
  - Charles V (Holy Roman Emperor, aka Charles I of Spain) "world monarchy . . . towards the gathering of all Christendom under a single shepherd."
  - Philip II (Spain)—saw his reign as justified by religion—Catholic above all else.
  - Ferdinand and Isabella (Spain) —Spanish Inquisition, religious conformity, Moriscos and Marranos.
  - Francis I (France) title included "the Most Christian king."
  - Henry IV (Henry of Navarre) French Wars of Religion, "Paris is worth a mass," Edict of Nantes, *politique,* changed his religion in order to rule.
  - Henry VIII, broke with the papacy, established monarchical authority over papal authority.
  - Mary Tudor, restored Catholicism in England, returned Church from monarchical authority to papal authority.
  - Elizabeth returned Church from papal authority to monarchical authority; thwarted Philip II at every turn, defeated the *Armada Católica*.

- Popes of the sixteenth century sought to reaffirm papal authority over Catholicism, Curia, conciliar movement, monarchs, international Catholicism.
- Cardinals sought to affirm power of the conciliar movement as superior to that of the pope.
- Curia sought to reaffirm power of the institutional structure of the Church.
- Deepening of religious and spiritual experience among faithful Catholics.
- Missionary and humanitarian work in Europe, Africa, Asia, Americas.
- Movement to modernize the Church by returning to early, simpler Church practices.

METHODS:

Methods for accomplishing aims may be categorized as Catholic reforms or changes in religious practice, anti-Protestant responses, assertions of Church or papal power, or political actions.

- Council of Trent (1545, periodically until 1563): review, reform, enunciation of Church doctrine and practice
  - Review and enunciation of doctrine:
    - Justification by faith and good works
    - Equal weight to tradition and scripture
    - Transubstantiation
    - Seven sacraments
    - Special status of the priest
    - Priest participation in confession and absolution
    - Purgatory
  - Reform of some practices:
    - Indulgences curtailed
    - Rules for holding Church offices
    - Education of priests (e.g., seminaries, printing press may be cited, improved preaching)
  - Reassertion of most practices:
    - Vulgate (St. Jerome) Bible
    - Latin as the language of worship
    - Key role of priests in worship and the religious experience
    - Veneration of saints; adoration of Mary
    - Use of images, relics, pilgrimages
    - Celibacy of clergy and monasticism upheld

- Political
  - Church: strengthened and reaffirmed central authority of the Church; high papalism
  - Diplomatic: involvement in national and international politics
  - Government: (Where Catholics retained control of governments, Protestants tended to dwindle into small minorities. Where Protestants won control of government, people became Protestant.)
  - Direct and indirect involvement in international politics
  - Military action
    - Spain, Catholic crusade in Europe; Armada (*Armada Católica)*
    - French Wars of Religion
    - Schmalkaldic War

- Virtually no concessions to Protestantism, especially after 1541
- Missionary work, conversion and reconversion, in Europe, Africa, Asia, Americas
- Mysticism—St. Theresa of Avila, et al.
- New Catholic Orders: Jesuits, Ursulines, Oratorians
- Inquisitions
  - Spanish
  - Roman
- Reforming popes: Paul III, Leo X, Paul IV
- Censorship of books (*Index of Forbidden Books*)
- Art—the Baroque

DEGREE OF SUCCESS:

Successes: Cup half empty or half full?
- Church survived.
- Maintained all beliefs.
- Many who left returned to Catholicism.
- Deepened and reinvigorated religious experience.
- Pope's role reasserted.
- Central authority of the Church as an institution reasserted.
- Education of priests and others given added importance.
- Where Catholics retained control of governments, Protestants became in time small minorities.
- Missionaries, Francis Xavier.

Failures:
- Religious divisions became a permanent reality in European culture.
- May have led to a gradual secularization of modern societies.
- Peace of Augsburg, 1555, gave German princes right to choose religion.
- Charles V gave up after 35 years, abdicated, and retired to a monastery.
- Philip II:
  - Stupendous failure of his Catholic crusades .
  - English, Dutch, and the French Huguenots' causes undeterred .
  - Spain bankrupted, virtually destroyed.
- Religious divisions destroyed the expectation of peacefulness within homes and communities.
- May have strengthened nationalism.
- Where Protestants won control of government, people became Protestant.

Visit apcentral.collegeboard.com (for AP professionals) and www.collegeboard.com/apstudents (for students and parents).

16

Commonly Cited Evidence:

Paul III	1534-49	Council of Troubles (. . . Blood)	
Julius III	1550-55	Francis I	1515-47
Paul IV	1555-59	Henry II	1547-59
Pius IV	1559-65	Charles IX	1560–1674
Pius V	1566-72	French Wars of Religion	1562-98
Gregory XIII	1572-85	St. Bart's Day Massacre	1572
Sixtus V	1585-90	Henry IV (Henry of Navarre)	1589–1610
Peace of Augsburg	1555	Edict of Nantes	1598
Luther, *95 Theses*	1517	Ignatius Loyola *Spiritual Exercises*	1491–1556
Diet of Worms	1521	Jesuits	1540
Augsburg Confession	1530	Teresa of Avila	1515-82
Council of Trent	1545-47; 1551-52, 1562-63	Ursulines	
Charles V	1519-56	Capuchins—Franciscans, simplicity, poverty, direct preaching	
Philip II	1556-98	Benedictines, Dominicans—reformed/renewed	
Henry VIII	1509-47		
Mary Tudor	1553-58	Theatines, 1524, reformers, orphanages and hospitals	
Elizabeth I	1558–1603		
Sack of Rome	1529	Oratory of Divine Love, Italy, clergy and laymen (1497)	
Lepanto	1571	Francis Xavier, 1506-52—began as Jesuit—to East	
Spanish Armada	1588		
Catholic League	1580's		
Union of Arras	1579		

Part B - 3

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering on this page as it is designated in the examination.

The beggining of the 16th century brought with it the Reformation. Finally, after many centuries, people began challenging the Roman Catholic Church such as Martin Luther and John Calvin. By the mid 16th century, the Catholic Church realized it needed to re-establish itself, which signafied the start of the "counter-reformation." The Counterreformation in Europe was implemented to halt the Prot Protestent reformation and build-back the power of the Catholic Church through education, clergy reforms, and missionary practice. The Counterreformation was successful in saving the integrity of the RCC, but it did not end Protestantism. Protestants had exploited the faults of the RCC, and that was the first thing the counterreformation dealt with.

The RCC, through the Council of Trent, made new laws for Catholic priests, involving gambling, drinking, and having sex. Priests were also not allowed to miss mass through the reform of Absenteeism. The Protestants had found corruption within the priests, and the

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering on this page as it is designated in the examination.

Part B - 3 — A2

Council at Trent quickly fixed them. Also, the selling of indulgences was outlawed. Indulgences had been criticized greatly by Luther in his 95 Thesis, and the RCC realized their fault. After dealing with the internal problems of the Catholic Church, the counterreformation began to build back the power of the RCC.

The education of Catholic priests and nuns became very popular. Now priests were required education in theology everywhere across the map in Europe. The Ursalines, were a group of Catholic women who were famous for the Catholic education of women. The next step after education, was spreading the Catholic word.

Ignatius Loyola and his group of Jesuits were prominent aids on the Catholic reformation. The Jesuits relied heavily on missionaries as did John Calvin and Calvinists. Loyola and his followers traveled all over ~~Engla~~ Europe and foreign countries, spreading

Catholic world. The Jesuits were able to spark a new popularity with their hard work ethic and focus on "good deeds." The Jesuits were able to bring Catholicism back from redroute.

The counterreformation came at a time when the RCC was in great peril. Luther and Calvin had gained popularity with their Protestant teachings, and had pointed out corruption within the RCC. The goal of the counterreformation was to save the face of Catholicism, and stop the Protestant reformation. The RCC did this by reforming the church and clergy, educating priests, and spreading the Catholic word around Europe. The counterreformation saved the RCC from destruction, and created a turnaround for the church.

3.

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering 3-B-1
on this page as it is designated in the examination. that

The Protestant Reformation ~~that~~ began with ~~started by~~ Martin Luther's 95 theses was countered by the Catholic Reformation. Martin Luther in 1517 put up his 95 theses proclaiming that the selling of indulgences was wrong and that simony, selling of church offices was wrong as well. Martin Luther believed salvation was obtained by faith alone. Luther believed that faith came from only one source the Bible and that only two sacraments communion and baptism were justified by the Bible. Martin Luther believed that the Catholic Church was corrupted and began the reformation. The Protestant Reformation was not attacked at first because it was looked upon as a trivial complain by a foolish monk. ~~But~~ However, because of the printing press, the comments by Luther spread and hurt the Catholic Church. The Catholic Church decided to act. The Catholic Reformation aimed to reduce the

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering on this page as it is designated in the examination.

3   3-B 2

spread of Protestism by publishing the Index of Forbidden Books and calling forth the Council of Trent. The Society of Jesuits helped the success of the Catholic Reformation.

The Catholic Church censored some of the books in which ideas against the church were exemplified. The church published the Index of Forbidden Books. The Index included the teachings of Erasmus and any other author against the church. The Catholic Reformation was trying to limit the access of new thought and ideas to the people because these books emphasized new ways of faith and salvation and also denounced certain practices of the clergy. The Index was published in order to hide the ~~indigressions of~~ digressions of the Catholic Church. The Index did work for a while but the printing press and the black market made it hard for censorship.

The Catholic Reformation also called the Council of Trent to help bring back trust into the Catholic

3

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering 3-B3
on this page as it is designated in the examination.

church. The Council of Trent helped denounce the practices of the Protestants and tried to ~~show that~~ illustrate the inefficiencies of the salvation and faiths of the Protestant. The Council of Trent also reformed the church itself. It limited the sale of indulgences and tried to purify the church. The Council of Trent tried to reform the practices in which the Protestants denounced in order to bring back faith to the Catholic church. The Council of Trent was another attempt to reduce the influence of Protestantism.

The success of the Catholic Reformation is due to the loyalty of the Society of Jesus or the Jesuits, by Loyola. Loyola believed that even if a Bible was not available the spirit can help reach salvation and faith. The Society of Jesuits were loyal to the Catholic Church which in the end helped reduce the influence of Protestantism in Europe.

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering
on this page as it is designated in the examination.

3.

3-B 4

In the sixteenth century, the Catholic
Reformation succeeded in reducing the spread
of ~~the~~ Protestantism in Europe. The Index
of Forbidden Books helped label those that
opposed the Catholic church's traditions and
policies. The Council of Trent helped
reform the Catholic church itself to mitigate
and bring back trust in the area of
religion. Finally, the Society of Jesus' loyalty
to the church helped the Catholic Reformation
to succeed in reducing the influence and spread
of Protestantism.

eventhough they waited so long
to act opon the beginnings of the
~~Protest~~ Protestant Reformation.

In response to the growing Protestant Reformation, the Catholic Church used methods such as religious orders to greatly salvage and further the Image of the Church.

The specific goals of the Catholic Reformation and Counter-Reformation were slightly different but the ultimate objective was the same. In the Catholic Reformation, abuses and scandals inside the Church were being solved. These included: the selling of indulgences; the selling of Church positions, known as simony; the lack of educated priests, and priests in general. Another would be to restate the doctrine of Church for everyone to hear. The Counter-Reformation, instigated by the Church, had goals towards battling Protestantism and converting people back to Catholicism.

The main way the Church would solve the problems and achieve the goals in the Catholic Reformation was to call the Council of Trent. This council, which was held in the audience of the pope, cardinals, & bishops, reformed the corrupted practices of the Church and fortified the doctrine which was unchanged. Religious orders, such as the Jesuits, joined the Counter-Reformation to go out among the people and teach about the goodness and mercy of the improved Church.

Both Reformations had a great deal of success as shown by having more educated priests and lay people. Religious orders converted many people back to the Roman

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering on this page as it is designated in the examination.

3-C-2

Catholic faith and also put down heresies. For example, the Dominicans are given credit for doing away with Albegensian heretics. The massive success of these movements keeps the majority of Europe Catholic and still does even to this day.

AP® EUROPEAN HISTORY
2006 SCORING COMMENTARY

Question 3

Overview

The question required students to analyze the relationship between the aims and methods of the Catholic Reformation in the sixteenth century and then to evaluate the outcomes based on the aims and methods the essay identified.

Sample: 3A
Score: 9

This essay has a clear analytical thesis that establishes aims (respond to the Protestant Reformation), methods (clarify doctrine, reform abuses), and outcomes (failure to eliminate Protestantism or unite Europe). The student further develops and analyzes the thesis concepts throughout the essay and establishes strong linkages among aims, methods, and outcomes. The essay is rich in historical detail notwithstanding minor errors (conciliarism = democratic movement). The essay effectively uses historical context preceding the Protestant Reformation to develop discussion and to explain failure of methods, i.e., disputes within the Church over abusive practices, conciliar movement, and poorly educated priests. The essay discusses reform—Council of Trent; reaffirmation of beliefs; curtailing of abuses; and the founding of the Jesuits. The student also provides thoughtful analysis of success and failures.

Sample: 3B
Score: 7

The student begins with an off-task narrative on Luther but uses this to establish aims (stop the spread of Protestantism, bring back trust) and methods (reforms—Council of Trent; prevent the spread of dangerous ideas—the Index; counter Protestantism—Jesuits/missionary work). Analysis is limited, and the writing is somewhat unsophisticated, but the essay employs sufficient and appropriate examples and demonstrates understanding of their significance.

Sample: 3C
Score: 2

This essay compares/contrasts the two Reformations and lists grievances with the Church. The thesis is weak, and the essay is mostly narrative with little appropriate evidence. Aims and methods are described but not analyzed, and the reference to the Albigensian issue is out of the time period.