
AP European History

Sample Student Responses and Scoring Commentary

Inside:

Short Answer Question 3

- Scoring Guideline**
- Student Samples**
- Scoring Commentary**

AP[®] EUROPEAN HISTORY 2018 SCORING GUIDELINES

Short Answer Question 3

Generic Scoring Guide

0–3 points

Score 3

Response accomplishes **all three** tasks set by the question.

Score 2

Response accomplishes **two** of the tasks set by the question.

Score 1

Response accomplishes **one** of the tasks set by the question.

Score 0

Response accomplishes **none** of the tasks set by the question.

Score NR

Is completely blank

Question-Specific Scoring Guide:

- One point for describing one reason for Martin Luther’s critique of the Catholic Church in the early 1500s
- One point for describing one Catholic response in the 1500s to Luther’s critique
- One point for explaining how Luther’s protest contributed to social change in Europe in the period 1517–1600

Scoring Notes

Acceptable responses to part (a) (not exhaustive):

“Reasons for Luther’s critique” can be understood as aspects of Church doctrine or practice that Luther denounced, either before his formal break with Rome or afterward. To meet the minimal standard of “describe,” the response must accurately recount a doctrine or practice that Luther criticized or rejected. It is not necessary for the response to offer an explicit explanation of why Luther criticized or rejected a particular doctrine or practice, but the response must do more than name-drop. Acceptable responses can also take the form of accurate descriptions of how a belief or practice of Luther led him to challenge established Catholic traditions (e.g., “Luther believed in the priesthood of all believers, so he felt that many of the Catholic sacraments were unnecessary.”)

- Sale of indulgences — Catholics were offered forgiveness for sins in return for payment to the Church. (Stronger responses will likely add that the practice — and, to some extent, the existence of Purgatory — lacked direct Scriptural authority.)
- Use of the Latin language in Catholic rituals that many people did not understand.
- The absence of explicit reference in the Bible to the number or details of the sacraments.
- Papal appointment of bishops and control over churches in German territories.

AP[®] EUROPEAN HISTORY

2018 SCORING GUIDELINES

Short Answer Question 3 (continued)

- The Catholic practices of allowing clergy to receive the income from several parishes without performing any pastoral duties there (plurality of office) or simony (the selling of Church offices).
- Inadequate priestly education, leading to errors in the Mass.
- The Catholic requirement that clergy remain celibate.

Additional notes:

Responses of this type, lacking any further information, should not be accepted:

- “Luther said the Church was corrupt.”
- “Luther attacked the Church in his famous 95 Theses.”

Acceptable responses to part (b) (not exhaustive):

“Responses to Luther’s critique” can be understood as actions taken by the Catholic Church in response to the words or actions of Luther and his followers. These actions can be **reforms initiated by the Church** or **actions intended to counter the spread of Lutheranism**, and not merely a generally oppositional stance to Luther’s ideas. To meet the minimal standard of “describe,” the response must accurately recount a Catholic action. It is not necessary to offer an explicit explanation of the connection between the Catholic response and a specific aspect of Luther’s critique, but it is necessary to do more than simply identify the Council of Trent.

The best responses will note that, particularly by means of Papal initiatives and at the meetings of the Council of Trent, the Church shored up its interpretation of some theological concepts while conceding points on others. It is not an acceptable response merely to state that the Church was “angered by” or “opposed to” Luther’s criticisms, nor merely that he was excommunicated or forced to attend the Diet of Worms. It is an acceptable response if either of these is connected to an attack on Luther’s criticisms, e.g., “Luther was told to recant his criticisms of the sale of indulgences and, if he did not, was threatened with excommunication or worse.”

- Reassertion of Catholic doctrine at the Council of Trent, such as the reinstatement of the Latin translation of the Bible (the Vulgate)
- Reforms of the Council of Trent, such as the abolition of plurality of office, the creation of new Catholic educational institutions, or the various decisions of the Council of Trent on indulgences (which were declared efficacious for salvation in 1563 and yet were banned for sale by Pope Pius V in 1567)
- Encouragement of anti-Protestant military campaigns by Catholic rulers (although these should be within the chronological period, e.g., not the Thirty Years’ War)
- Foundation of new religious orders — particularly the Jesuits and Ursulines — to combat the spread of Lutheranism and to reconvert Protestants to Catholicism
- Sponsoring of overseas missions to spread Catholicism beyond Europe

AP[®] EUROPEAN HISTORY 2018 SCORING GUIDELINES

Short Answer Question 3 (continued)

Additional notes:

Some responses attempt to earn the point by listing an attack on Luther personally, rather than on his “critique”, as stated in the Prompt. Responses of this type, lacking further elaboration, should not be accepted:

- “Obviously, the Church was not happy with Luther’s criticisms since they tried to kill him.”
- “The Church ignored/rejected Luther’s criticisms.”
- “By excommunicating Luther, the Church hoped to discredit his critique.”

Acceptable responses to part (c) (not exhaustive):

To meet the minimal standard of “explain,” the response must offer some minimally accurate **linkage** between the spread of Luther’s ideas and a social change in Europe. “Social change” can be broadly understood to be any change in group identification, relationships among social orders or classes, gender roles, or family structure and relationships, which can be connected to Luther’s ideas.

The best responses will connect Luther’s theological arguments to a noticeable change in personal relationships, such as between social classes, within nation-states, or among family members. It is an acceptable response to comment that the proliferation of new Protestant groups shattered the religious unity of Western Europe, as long as it connects the resulting violence to a specific social change. However, it is not sufficient to state, simply, that “Lutheran” was a new way to identify oneself or that Lutheranism led to a separation of Church and State, at least in the 16th century.

- Luther’s ideas about the priesthood of all believers encouraged social uprisings and revolts, in particular the Peasants’ War (although this linkage was disavowed by Luther).
- Luther’s belief that everyone should read the Bible led to the encouragement of education and the growth of literacy.
- Lutherans’ use of vernacular languages strengthened the identification of various groups and individuals with particular nations.
- The violence of various wars of religion sometimes led to a recognition of the need for religious tolerance (e.g., the Peace of Augsburg, the rise of *politiques* and the Edict of Nantes, Elizabeth I “not making windows into men’s souls”).
- Lutheranism’s rejection of papal authority and of the sacramental function of priests led to the disappearance of the clergy as a politically recognized and privileged social order in many areas.
- The abolition of Catholic female religious institutions in Protestant areas removed an opportunity for some women to exercise authority.
- Luther’s rejection of celibacy led to a greater valuation of marriage and the family as a means of moral instruction (e.g., his marriage to the former nun Katharina von Bora).
- In some cases, the “priesthood of all believers” concept promoted assertiveness among women to read the Bible for themselves and to proclaim their own interpretations of it (e.g., the Anabaptists Elizabeth Dirks and Anna Jansz or the Lutheran Argula von Grumbach).

AP[®] EUROPEAN HISTORY

2018 SCORING GUIDELINES

Short Answer Question 3 (continued)

Additional notes:

Some responses attempt to earn the point by listing a social change of the period but fail to connect it to Luther's protest. Responses of this type, lacking an explicit link to Luther's criticisms, should not be accepted:

- "There were a lot of new religious choices, and the Protestant Reformation would continue to change everything up until the present day."
- "A lot of people were killed in religious wars."
- "The printing press spread Protestant ideas."
- "Luther's protest led to the social changes of the Scientific Revolution/Enlightenment."

Write your answer to **SHORT-ANSWER QUESTION 3 or 4** on this page only. Do NOT write outside the box.

- a. Martin Luther despised the Catholic Church's sale of indulgences for forgiveness of ~~the~~ a sin after Johann Tetzel came through his region selling them.
- b. After the Council of Trent ended, the Catholic Counter-Reformation stopped the sale of indulgences but ~~the~~ kept them ~~the~~ overall.
- c. Luther contributed to reforming the Church and making its corruption less prevalent while also fracturing ~~the~~ Western Christianity into ~~the~~ many new religions, including Anabaptists, Lutherans and Calvinists. He changed the way people went to church and how religion is organized, which changed the European people's way of life to be less God-fearing. When Luther translated the Bible into German, he allowed commoners in his country to read and interpret scripture for the first time which led to ~~the~~ ^{many} more opinions on the matter.

End of response area for Question 3 or Question 4

Write your answer to SHORT-ANSWER QUESTION 3 or 4 on this page only. Do NOT write outside the box.

A) In the early 1500s, Martin Luther was practicing being a monk, and while reading Scripture, he discovered that the Bible states no money will get someone to heaven. At the time, members of the clergy, such as Johann Tetzel sold expensive indulgences stating that money would spring a soul from purgatory. Luther found this atrocious, he believed in faith alone, grace alone, Scripture alone. Not money alone.

B) The Council of Trent was a response by the Catholic Church during the 1500s. Holy Roman Emperor Charles V called a meeting with Luther and other important religious figures to hear what ~~the deal was~~ the deal was. Luther spoke and explained how he came to the conclusions he did about religion.

C) Luther's protests did a lot to encourage circulation of printed materials during 1517-1600. Luther's ideas and statements were printed when they could be. This encouraged literacy around Europe. The printing press was relatively new, and so having religious materials in vernacular/German encouraged more common people to read and become involved.

End of response area for Question 3 or Question 4

Write your answer to SHORT-ANSWER QUESTION 3 or 4 on this page only. Do NOT write outside the box.

a) Martin Luther believed that the church did not stick to their morals and therefore, that the church was corrupt. For example, they allowed powerful individuals to revoke ^{the} marriages, ~~by~~ not divorcing, but by making it seem like it never happened. This defies the sacrament of marriage.

b) ~~Some Catholics converted~~ Some Catholics converted after the Catholic church was deemed as corrupt. Others did not believe Luther's words and simply denied any corrupt or immoral actions of the church. Overall, the need for reform became very evident over time. Therefore, people started looking for ways of reformation - The Catholic Reformation.

c) The work and protests of Luther became very popular around Europe. Many read his "95 Theses" and became a follower of his ideals. Therefore, many wanted to be a part of the Catholic Reformation.

Protests are a very effective way for change and people began to participate more as they realized its what needed to be done.

End of response area for Question 3 or Question 4

AP[®] EUROPEAN HISTORY 2018 SCORING COMMENTARY

Short Answer Question 3

Overview

a) Describe one reason for Martin Luther’s critique of the Catholic Church in the early 1500s.

Responses were expected to show one way in which Martin Luther critiqued Catholic practices and beliefs (indulgences, etc.) and why that critique may have been levied. More successful responses discussed how these critiques established new interpretations of Christian doctrine and practice. This part of the question, and others in the three-part SAQ prompt, asked students to explicitly grapple with the issue of how religious pluralism challenged the concept of a unified Europe. This content is addressed in the curriculum framework in Key Concept 1.2.I. B.

b) Describe one Catholic response in the 1500s to Luther’s critique.

Responses were expected to address how the Catholic Church responded to critiques made by Luther, focusing primarily on the Catholic Reformation and the ways in which these responses were reflected in developments like the establishment of the Jesuit order or the Council of Trent. More successful responses were able to illustrate how these developments were intended to revive Catholicism and highlight how these may have exacerbated religious divisions. This content is addressed in Key Concept 1.2.I. D in the curriculum framework.

c) Explain how Luther’s protest contributed to social change in Europe in the period 1517 to 1600.

Responses were expected to showcase an understanding of how these religious critiques and disputes led to both religious and social change. More successful responses focused on changes to family structures and gender roles, the shifting status of different social groups, and the ways in which religion moved from being a matter of public concern to one of private belief. These topics are addressed in Thematic Learning Objectives IS-2, IS-4, and OS-8 in the curriculum framework.

Sample: 3A

Score: 3

The response to part a) earned 1 point because it succinctly describes the indulgences issue.

The response to part b) earned 1 point because it briefly but accurately describes the Church’s conceptual preservation of indulgences, while forbidding their sale.

The response to part c) earned 1 point because it offers several explanations of social changes stemming from the Reformation; the best is the connection made between the German translation of the Bible and its interpretation by “commoners.”

Sample: 3B

Score: 2

The response to part a) earned 1 point because it gives an unusually detailed description of Luther's critique of indulgences (incorporating an element of Tetzels sales pitch).

The response to part b) did not earn a point because it apparently confuses the Council of Trent and the Diet of Worms and does not describe a Catholic response to Luther's critiques.

**AP[®] EUROPEAN HISTORY
2018 SCORING COMMENTARY**

Short Answer Question 3 (continued)

The response to part c) earned 1 point because it adequately connects the German translation of the Bible to the printing press and the spread of literacy.

Sample: 3C
Score: 1

The response to part a) earned 1 point because, while a bit vague on the idea of annulments, it suggests that Luther saw the Church's practice of granting annulments as hypocritical regarding marriage (which Luther did not believe was among the sacraments).

The response to part b) did not earn a point because the Catholic Reformation is named, but Catholic responses to Luther's critiques are not adequately described.

The response to part c) did not earn a point because the popularity of Lutheran ideas is introduced, but an explanation of their social effect is not adequately developed.